

# **City of Charlottesville, VA**

## **2022 Classification & Compensation Study**

### **Final Report**

Gallagher Human Resources & Compensation Consulting Practice  
March 2023



**Gallagher**

Insurance | Risk Management | Consulting



**Gallagher**

Insurance | Risk Management | Consulting

# Table of Contents

---

Study Background

---

Classification Study

---

Compensation Study

---

Recommended Salary Structure and Implementation Cost

---

Pay Practices and Benefits Summary

---

Recommendations and Ongoing Maintenance

---



# Study Background

- The City of Charlottesville (the City) partnered with Gallagher Benefit Services, Inc. (Gallagher) to conduct a comprehensive classification and compensation study for approximately 225 job titles within the City covering approximately 993 employees.
- Gallagher Consultants met with City officials in February 2022 to discuss the study process and initiate project activities.
- The primary objectives of the study were to:
  - Evaluate jobs to determine relative worth, internal equity, pay ranges, and range progressions.
  - Review job classifications and recommend changes to hierarchical order.
  - Analyze and recommend changes to the City’s current compensation structure.
  - Identify pay compression issues and recommend solutions.



**Gallagher**

Insurance | Risk Management | Consulting

# Classification Study



# Classification Study

Per the initial study scope, Gallagher would use current job descriptions to understand and verify the nature and level of work of each job. In March 2022, Gallagher was informed that job descriptions were not current and requested that employees complete a position description questionnaire (PDQ) to collect job information. As requested by the City, PDQ's were completed in phases by work groups. This approach extended the timeline by 16 weeks.

- Position Description Questionnaires (PDQs) were then utilized as the basis for the analysis of classification structure.
- PDQs were distributed to all City employees in the general workforce group.
- Employees completed individual or group PDQs to provide current job-related information.
- PDQs were reviewed by supervisors and department heads with opportunity to comment.
- ~679 (68% response rate) PDQ's for employees were reviewed by Gallagher for classification and appropriate FLSA status.



# Classification Study

- Gallagher provided recommendations for grouping of current position titles based on levels of responsibilities, and standard classification titles.
  - Ensures greater consistency across the City.
  - Simplifies the classification structure to ensure ease of administration.
    - ≈ Combined classifications performing similar type of work within a job family.
    - ≈ Re-titled classifications based on the recommended titling convention.
    - ≈ Identified career ladders/promotional opportunities as appropriate



# Classification Study

The following graphic is an example of the steps for development of a classification structure.





**Gallagher**

Insurance | Risk Management | Consulting

# Compensation Study





# Data Collection and Analysis

## Survey Data Collection Process

- To collect external market compensation data, Gallagher worked with the City to identify a total of 237 benchmark jobs that represented different functional areas and levels across the City. The Benchmark jobs list was approved by the City on 10/18/2022.
- Benchmark jobs represented approximately 87% of employees included in the study.
- Gallagher then utilized the following published survey sources to collect market data:
  - Willis Towers Watson surveys
  - Mercer surveys
  - CompData surveys
  - Economic Research Institute (ERI)
- Market data collected from the published survey sources represent local, regional, and national geographic labor markets where applicable.



# Data Collection and Analysis

## Custom Survey Data Collection Process

- Gallagher then developed a custom survey that collected market data for 143 of the 237 benchmark positions.
- In collaboration with the City, Gallagher then identified and sent out the custom survey to the following 26 comparable peer organizations consisting primarily of cities and counties in the southeast region of the U.S.

Comparator Organizations (26 Total)			
Cities		Counties	Towns
City of Alexandria	City of Richmond	Albemarle County	Town of Blacksburg
City of Danville	City of Roanoke	Arlington County	Town of Leesburg
City of Fredericksburg	City of Salem	Fairfax County*	
City Harrisonburg	City of Staunton	Fauquier County*	
City of Lynchburg*	City of Suffolk	Greene County	
City of Manassas	City of Williamsburg	Hanover County	
City of Petersburg*	City of Winchester	Henrico County	
City of Portsmouth		Loudon County	
		Prince William County	

Custom Survey Response Rate: 15%  
 Response Rate with Gallagher Data Mining: 85%

# Data Collection and Analysis



Insurance | Risk Management | Consulting

## Published and Custom Survey Data Collection and Analysis Process

### Aging Salary Data

- Survey data was aged to a common effective date, December 1, 2022, using the WorldatWork prevailing market trend of 4% per year for actual salaries, 3% for salary ranges.

### Data Adjustments

- Survey data was adjusted geographically to reflect the “cost of labor” for City of Charlottesville, VA area as calculated by the Economic Research Institute (ERI) Geographic Assessor.
  - Included in excel workbook - Tab: GEO for custom survey and Tab: GEO 2 for published surveys.
  - “Cost of labor” refers to the difference in pay or labor market for a job from one location to another. The cost of labor is what a particular geographic market offers as the “going rate” or compensation for its jobs and reflects the local demand for and supply of labor.
  - Thus, if market data were collected from a particular geographic location, they were adjusted downward/upward based on Charlottesville’s cost of labor differential.

### Outlier Analysis

- Gallagher applied statistical tools to identify and review any outliers.
- Gallagher follows the Federal Trade Commission and the U.S. Department of Labor guidelines that five (5) matches should exist per job in order to draw reliable conclusions. Therefore, we do not calculate statistics (means, medians, etc.) on jobs with fewer than five (5) job matches.

# Market Comparison Results



Insurance | Risk Management | Consulting

The following guidelines were used when determining the competitive nature of the City's current compensation:

- The difference from the market for each benchmark is calculated as the following:
  - City data minus market data divided by the market data:
    - ≈ A positive figure indicates that the City pays above the market.
    - ≈ A negative figure indicates that the City pays below the market.

+/-5%	Highly Competitive
+/-10%	Competitive
+/-10 to 15%	Possible misalignment with the market
Greater than +/- 15%	Misalignment with market

The following table depicts how the City's salaries compare to various market points.

Overall City Comparison						
	Market 25 <sup>th</sup>	Market 50 <sup>th</sup> (Actual)	Market 50 <sup>th</sup> (Range Mid)	Market 75 <sup>th</sup>	Market Range Min	Market Range Max
Full Market (Custom + Published Data)	+10.3	-2.3%	-5.5%	-14.1%	-10.2%	+4.9%

Overall, at the 50<sup>th</sup> percentile, the City is highly competitive with the full market.

# Benchmark Summary



Insurance | Risk Management | Consulting

Job Title	City Base Salary	Combined Market Base 50th	Base Diff. w/50th
Accountant	\$52,000	\$57,241	-9.2%
Accounting Assistant	\$51,061	\$46,706	9.3%
Accounting Specialist	\$54,746	\$52,485	4.3%
Accounting Supervisor	\$71,521	\$88,464	-19.2%
Accounting/Finance Manager	\$82,451	\$103,303	-20.2%
Administrative Assistant	\$44,034	\$41,805	5.3%
Administrative Coordinator	n/a	\$44,457	n/a
Administrative Specialist	\$54,808	\$48,181	13.8%
Administrative Supervisor	\$66,837	\$69,565	-3.9%
Animal Control Officer	\$43,722	\$43,939	-0.5%
Appraiser I	n/a	\$49,564	n/a
Appraiser II	\$58,427	\$56,783	2.9%
Appraiser III	\$75,421	\$66,387	13.6%
Appraiser Supervisor	\$92,830	n/a	n/a
Assistant Attorney	\$98,661	\$97,572	1.1%
Assistant Chief Of Police	\$126,422	\$132,157	-4.3%
Assistant Day Camp Director	\$37,640	n/a	n/a
Assistant Engineer	n/a	\$76,683	n/a
Assistant Library Director	\$89,752	n/a	n/a
Assistant Registrar	n/a	n/a	n/a
Asst Zoning Administrator	\$67,766	n/a	n/a
Asst. Social Services Coordinator	\$65,728	\$74,488	-11.8%
Attorney	n/a	\$212,365	n/a
Cash Management Supervisor	\$76,773	\$75,125	2.2%
Cash Management Technician	\$50,638	\$56,295	-10.0%
Chief Deputy Court Clerk	\$67,059	\$72,755	-7.8%
Chief Deputy Registrar	n/a	n/a	n/a
Chief Deputy Sheriff	\$77,854	\$107,379	-27.5%
Chief Deputy Treasurer	\$87,776	\$74,349	18.1%
Chief Deputy-Commissioner Of Revenue	\$80,184	n/a	n/a
Chief of Police	n/a	\$167,509	n/a
City Assessor	\$119,350	\$110,573	7.9%
City Attorney	\$189,654	\$181,084	4.7%
City Engineer	\$107,318	\$106,091	1.2%
City Sheriff	\$112,882	\$114,391	-1.3%
City Treasurer	\$136,240	\$95,963	42.0%
Clerk Of Circuit Court	\$148,450	n/a	n/a

# Benchmark Summary



Insurance | Risk Management | Consulting

Job Title	City Base Salary	Combined Market Base 50th	Base Diff. w/50th
Climate Protection Program Manager	\$72,613	n/a	n/a
Coach I	\$35,184	n/a	n/a
Coach II	\$45,614	n/a	n/a
Code Official	\$98,987	\$84,069	17.7%
Collection Supervisor	\$76,773	\$63,652	20.6%
Collections & Technology Manager	\$62,712	n/a	n/a
Collections Agent	\$47,580	\$44,704	6.4%
Commissioner Of Revenue	\$119,517	\$111,751	6.9%
Communications Specialist	\$46,426	\$59,630	-22.1%
Community Service Officer	\$44,100	n/a	n/a
Comptroller	\$122,491	\$166,914	-26.6%
Contract Coordinator	\$59,769	\$61,887	-3.4%
Courier	\$32,434	\$36,977	-12.3%
Custodial Supervisor	\$48,651	\$47,562	2.3%
Custodian	\$35,578	\$31,414	13.3%
Day Camp Counselor	\$33,126	\$33,618	-1.5%
Day Camp Director	\$47,908	\$80,327	-40.4%
Deputy Attorney	\$115,892	\$133,429	-13.1%
Deputy City Manager	\$193,565	\$181,060	6.9%
Deputy Code Official	\$65,853	n/a	n/a
Deputy Court Clerk	\$38,095	\$49,680	-23.3%
Deputy Director of Communications	n/a	n/a	n/a
DEPUTY DIRECTOR PARKS & REC	\$111,363	n/a	n/a
Deputy Fire Chief	\$116,293	\$119,175	-2.4%
Deputy Registrar	\$39,139	n/a	n/a
Deputy Sheriff	\$47,174	\$51,060	-7.6%
Development Services Manager	\$115,398	\$124,456	-7.3%
DIR OF ELECTIONS AND GENERAL REGISTRAR	\$101,296	\$113,143	-10.5%
DIR. BUDGET & PERFORMANCE MANAGEMENT	n/a	n/a	n/a
DIR. OF COMMUNITY SOLUTIONS	n/a	n/a	n/a
DIR. OF HUMAN RIGHTS COMMISSION	\$111,363	n/a	n/a
DIR. OF PARKS & RECREATION	\$158,330	\$130,363	21.5%
Director of Administration	\$107,078	n/a	n/a
Director of Economic & Planning Development	\$148,954	\$136,456	9.2%
Director of Finance	\$149,302	\$148,188	0.8%
Information Technology Director	\$156,790	\$150,435	4.2%

# Benchmark Summary



Insurance | Risk Management | Consulting

Job Title	City Base Salary	Combined Market Base 50th	Base Diff. w/50th
DIRECTOR OF LIBRARY	\$111,446	\$135,214	-17.6%
Director of Public Utilities	\$177,424	n/a	n/a
Director Of Public Works	\$163,779	\$152,845	7.2%
Director of Social Services	\$145,746	\$123,067	18.4%
Director of Transit	\$164,840	n/a	n/a
Emergency Services Assistant	\$68,169	n/a	n/a
Emergency Services Specialist	n/a	n/a	n/a
ENERGY MANAGEMENT COORDINATOR	\$71,698	n/a	n/a
Engineer	\$75,296	\$94,924	-20.7%
Environ. Sust. Mgr	\$120,266	\$107,708	11.7%
Executive Assistant	\$78,146	\$69,395	12.6%
Fire Battalion Chief/Emt	\$88,275	\$106,047	-16.8%
Fire Battalion Chief/Medic	\$91,179	n/a	n/a
Fire Captain/Emt	\$68,088	\$78,090	-12.8%
Fire Captain/Medic-56Hr	\$66,073	n/a	n/a
Fire Chief	n/a	\$143,903	n/a
Fire Equipment Mechanic	\$65,957	n/a	n/a
Firefighter/Emt	\$49,944	\$48,131	3.8%
Firefighter/Medic	\$49,429	\$48,610	1.7%
Fleet Manager	\$118,414	\$99,458	19.1%
Fleet Supervisor	\$72,675	\$70,257	3.4%
Forensic Support Specialist	\$49,639	n/a	n/a
GIS Analyst	\$55,640	\$68,228	-18.4%
GIS Coordinator	\$111,259	\$78,360	42.0%
GIS Technician	n/a	\$60,087	n/a
Grants Analyst	n/a	\$61,402	n/a
Group Exercise Instructor	\$49,767	\$48,729	2.1%
Housing Program Manager	n/a	n/a	n/a
HR Administrator	\$104,021	\$109,492	-5.0%
HR Assistant	n/a	\$47,987	n/a
HR Deputy Director	n/a	\$103,548	n/a
HR Director	\$161,491	\$137,969	17.0%
HR Generalist	\$66,134	\$67,959	-2.7%
HR Manager	n/a	\$82,289	n/a
HR Specialist	\$66,830	\$57,331	16.6%
Information Technology Administrator	\$69,243	\$86,743	-20.2%
Information Technology Engineer I	n/a	\$79,095	n/a

# Benchmark Summary



Insurance | Risk Management | Consulting

Job Title	City Base Salary	Combined Market Base 50th	Base Diff. w/50th
Information Technology Engineer II	\$77,133	\$91,909	-16.1%
Information Technology Engineer III	\$108,482	\$118,279	-8.3%
Information Technology Manager	\$91,634	\$127,407	-28.1%
Information Technology Specialist I	\$61,977	\$68,138	-9.0%
Information Technology Specialist II	\$74,994	\$84,398	-11.1%
Information Technology Supervisor	\$52,000	\$102,523	-49.3%
Information Technology Technician	\$55,068	\$56,017	-1.7%
Instructor	\$48,305	\$48,729	-0.9%
Intelligence Analyst	n/a	n/a	n/a
Lead Accounting/Financial Analyst	\$85,904	\$74,269	15.7%
Lead Custodian	\$41,974	\$40,153	4.5%
Legal Assistant	n/a	n/a	n/a
Librarian I	\$45,099	\$61,512	-26.7%
Librarian II	\$46,941	\$66,030	-28.9%
Library Manager I	\$56,682	\$64,700	-12.4%
Library Manager II	\$60,459	n/a	n/a
Library Specialist	\$37,535	\$52,390	-28.4%
Library Supervisor	\$42,926	\$60,449	-29.0%
Library Support Assistant	\$40,397	\$35,939	12.4%
Library Support Associate	\$32,035	\$43,385	-26.2%
Lifeguard I	\$32,322	n/a	n/a
Lifeguard II	\$35,755	n/a	n/a
Maintenance Lead	\$43,384	\$61,518	-29.5%
Maintenance Manager	\$101,213	\$97,923	3.4%
Maintenance Specialist	\$44,384	\$44,549	-0.4%
Maintenance Supervisor	\$63,925	\$68,270	-6.4%
Maintenance Technician	\$42,574	\$42,293	0.7%
Management Analyst I	n/a	\$65,320	n/a
Management Analyst II	\$89,464	\$91,218	-1.9%
Management Analyst III	\$96,439	\$106,021	-9.0%
Management Services Supervisor	\$76,274	n/a	n/a
Manager Economic & Planning Development	\$93,870	n/a	n/a
Marketing Coordinator	\$57,990	\$59,154	-2.0%
Meals Coordinator	\$56,846	\$56,050	1.4%
Meter Service Technician	\$49,143	n/a	n/a
Minority Business Development Coord	\$57,866	\$66,927	-13.5%
Motor Equipment Operator	\$44,557	\$43,882	1.5%
Multimedia Services Manager	n/a	\$102,853	n/a



# Benchmark Summary



Insurance | Risk Management | Consulting

Job Title	City Base Salary	Combined Market Base 50th	Base Diff. w/50th
Operations Manager I	\$73,133	n/a	n/a
Operations Manager II	\$87,311	n/a	n/a
Organizational Dev. & Learning Coord	n/a	\$93,581	n/a
Paralegal	n/a	\$55,064	n/a
Parking Manager	\$91,645	\$73,182	25.2%
Parks & Recreation Operations Specialist	\$49,640	\$61,460	-19.2%
Parks & Recreation Senior Operations Specialist	\$59,875	n/a	n/a
Permit Coordinator	n/a	n/a	n/a
Permit Technician	n/a	\$41,108	n/a
Personal Property Supervisor	\$76,794	n/a	n/a
Planner	\$63,565	\$56,882	11.7%
POLICE CORPORAL	\$67,028	n/a	n/a
Police Detective	\$57,788	n/a	n/a
Police Lieutenant	\$101,080	\$90,999	11.1%
Police Officer	\$56,038	\$52,013	7.7%
Police Records Specialist	\$46,377	\$42,325	9.6%
Police Recruit	\$47,237	n/a	n/a
POLICE SERGEANT	\$79,751	\$73,361	8.7%
Procurement Assistant	\$48,984	\$45,293	8.1%
Procurement Manager	\$113,776	\$98,357	15.7%
Procurement Supervisor	\$78,000	\$79,282	-1.6%
Procurement Technician	n/a	\$56,059	n/a
Program Coordinator	\$69,958	\$62,360	12.2%
Project Assistant	\$44,658	\$54,789	-18.5%
Project Manager	\$79,377	\$79,257	0.2%
Property Maintenance & Housing Inspector	\$45,538	\$50,172	-9.2%
Property Maintenance Code Official	\$69,056	n/a	n/a
Public Engagement Coordinator	\$56,867	n/a	n/a
Public Safety Information Officer	\$68,016	n/a	n/a
Recruitment Coordinator	n/a	n/a	n/a
Regulatory Compliance Supervisor	\$68,286	\$83,631	-18.3%
Revenue Compliance Administrator	\$53,033	n/a	n/a
Risk Manager	\$94,682	\$97,517	-2.9%
School Bus Aide	\$37,440	\$26,080	43.6%
Security Systems Manager	\$62,899	n/a	n/a
Senior Accountant	\$67,966	\$68,092	-0.2%
Senior Administrative Specialist	\$66,706	\$70,307	-5.1%

# Benchmark Summary



Insurance | Risk Management | Consulting

Job Title	City Base Salary	Combined Market Base 50th	Base Diff. w/50th
Senior Planner	\$64,736	\$77,680	-16.7%
Senior Project Manager	\$100,298	\$85,725	17.0%
Senior Social Services Assistant	n/a	\$53,948	n/a
Senior Social Services Specialist	\$64,178	\$60,878	5.4%
Social Service Assistant	\$43,249	\$44,659	-3.2%
Social Service Coordinator	\$66,290	\$74,488	-11.0%
Social Service Manager	\$97,240	\$97,861	-0.6%
Social Service Specialist	\$54,072	\$60,878	-11.2%
Social Service Supervisor	\$73,243	\$82,621	-11.4%
Sr Deputy Sheriff	\$57,876	n/a	n/a
Sr Youth Counselor	\$68,536	n/a	n/a
Sr. Deputy Registrar	\$45,157	n/a	n/a
State Inc/Relief Prog Supv	\$76,794	n/a	n/a
Street Maintenance Inspector	\$46,287	n/a	n/a
Tax Specialist	\$45,632	\$52,017	-12.3%
Transit Operator	\$45,496	\$37,898	20.0%
Transit Operator Lead	\$53,664	\$52,167	2.9%
Transit Operator Manager	\$101,770	n/a	n/a
Transit Operator Supervisor	\$59,072	n/a	n/a
Urban Forester/Arborist	\$70,158	n/a	n/a
Utilities Administrator	\$93,163	n/a	n/a
Utilities Construction Inspector	\$48,968	n/a	n/a
Utilities Contract Manager	\$80,080	\$103,307	-22.5%
Utilities Engineer	\$98,758	n/a	n/a
Utilities Equipment Operator	\$47,986	n/a	n/a
Utilities Maintenance Worker	\$41,995	n/a	n/a
Utilities Operations Manager	n/a	n/a	n/a
Utilities Service Dispatcher	\$43,343	\$43,295	0.1%
Utilities Services Technician	\$49,789	n/a	n/a
Utilities Supervisor	\$66,019	n/a	n/a
Vdot Coordinator	\$90,626	n/a	n/a
Vehicle & Equipment Lead	\$59,473	\$63,006	-5.6%
Vehicle & Equipment Technician	\$43,306	\$46,551	-7.0%
Water Resources Specialist	\$73,154	n/a	n/a
Workload Specialist	n/a	n/a	n/a

# Benchmark Summary



Insurance | Risk Management | Consulting

Job Title	City Base Salary	Combined Market Base 50th	Base Diff. w/50th
Youth Counselor	n/a	n/a	n/a
Youth Counselor Assistant	\$36,182	n/a	n/a
Zoning/E&S Administrator	\$69,264	\$77,549	-10.7%

*\*City Base Salaries reflect 2080 hours for 40 hour week or 2912 for 56 hour week employees*



**Gallagher**

Insurance | Risk Management | Consulting

# Salary Structure Development & Implementation

# Proposed Salary Structure Considerations



Insurance | Risk Management | Consulting

## Goals of the Proposed Salary Structures

- Comply with the City's strategy to stay competitive with the combined market at the 50<sup>th</sup> percentile.
- Develop a 20 pay grade structure.
- Maintain appropriate midpoint differentials to avoid cross grade compression.
  - Market best practice suggests midpoint differentials between 8% to 15% and up to 25% total midpoint differential between supervisor and subordinates would be efficient
- Minimum range starts at \$15/hour or \$31,200/year (2,080 hours).
- Starting pay for Transit Operators to be \$21/hour or \$43,680/year (2,080 hours), which is 14.3% above the market 50<sup>th</sup> percentile.

## Proposed Recommended Structure

- The proposed structure was developed using actual salary data at the 50th percentile of the combined labor market to determine the midpoints of the new structure. Minimums and maximums were calculated based on midpoints.
- Proposed structure has 20 pay grades.
- Midpoint differentials of 10% is implemented across grades.



# Salary Structure Development

## Proposed New Structure at Market:

Pay Grade	Minimum Annual	Midpoint Annual	Maximum Annual
T10	\$31,200	\$33,212	\$39,854
T11	\$31,675	\$36,533	\$43,840
T12	\$32,149	\$40,187	\$48,224
T13	\$35,364	\$44,205	\$53,046
T14	\$38,901	\$48,626	\$58,351
T15	\$42,791	\$53,488	\$64,186
P16	\$47,070	\$58,837	\$70,605
P17	\$51,777	\$64,721	\$77,665
P18	\$56,954	\$71,193	\$85,431
P19	\$62,650	\$78,312	\$93,975
P20	\$68,915	\$86,143	\$103,372
P21	\$75,806	\$94,758	\$113,709
P22	\$83,387	\$104,233	\$125,080
P23	\$91,725	\$114,657	\$137,588
M24	\$100,898	\$126,123	\$151,347
M25	\$110,988	\$138,735	\$166,482
M26	\$122,087	\$152,608	\$183,130
M27	\$134,295	\$167,869	\$201,443
M28	\$147,725	\$184,656	\$221,587
M29	\$162,497	\$203,122	\$243,746

# Salary Structure Development



Insurance | Risk Management | Consulting

## Proposed New Structure at Market - Transit:

- 2.1% increase between each step
- The step pay structure is 52% wide from Minimum to Step 20

Classification Title	Minimum Annual	Step 1	Step 2	Step 3	Step 4	Step 5	Step 6	Step 7	Step 8	Step 9	Step 10
Transit Operator	\$43,680	\$44,597	\$45,534	\$46,490	\$47,466	\$48,463	\$49,481	\$50,520	\$51,581	\$52,664	\$53,770
Transit Operator Lead	\$46,053	\$47,020	\$48,008	\$49,016	\$50,045	\$51,096	\$52,169	\$53,265	\$54,383	\$55,525	\$56,691
Transit Operator Supervisor	\$50,658	\$51,722	\$52,808	\$53,917	\$55,050	\$56,206	\$57,386	\$58,591	\$59,821	\$61,078	\$62,360
Transit Maintenance Technician	\$33,426	\$34,128	\$34,845	\$35,577	\$36,324	\$37,087	\$37,866	\$38,661	\$39,473	\$40,302	\$41,148
Transit Maintenance Specialist	\$35,398	\$36,142	\$36,901	\$37,676	\$38,467	\$39,275	\$40,099	\$40,942	\$41,801	\$42,679	\$43,575
Transit Bus Technician	\$36,791	\$37,564	\$38,353	\$39,158	\$39,980	\$40,820	\$41,677	\$42,552	\$43,446	\$44,358	\$45,290
Transit Bus Custodian	\$31,200	\$31,855	\$32,524	\$33,207	\$33,905	\$34,617	\$35,343	\$36,086	\$36,843	\$37,617	\$38,407

Classification Title	Step 11	Step 12	Step 13	Step 14	Step 15	Step 16	Step 17	Step 18	Step 19	Step 20
Transit Operator	\$54,899	\$56,052	\$57,229	\$58,431	\$59,658	\$60,911	\$62,190	\$63,496	\$64,829	\$66,191
Transit Operator Lead	\$57,882	\$59,097	\$60,338	\$61,605	\$62,899	\$64,220	\$65,569	\$66,945	\$68,351	\$69,787
Transit Operator Supervisor	\$63,670	\$65,007	\$66,372	\$67,766	\$69,189	\$70,642	\$72,125	\$73,640	\$75,186	\$76,765
Transit Maintenance Technician	\$42,012	\$42,894	\$43,795	\$44,715	\$45,654	\$46,612	\$47,591	\$48,591	\$49,611	\$50,653
Transit Maintenance Specialist	\$44,490	\$45,425	\$46,379	\$47,353	\$48,347	\$49,362	\$50,399	\$51,457	\$52,538	\$53,641
Transit Bus Technician	\$46,241	\$47,212	\$48,204	\$49,216	\$50,249	\$51,305	\$52,382	\$53,482	\$54,605	\$55,752
Transit Bus Custodian	\$39,214	\$40,037	\$40,878	\$41,736	\$42,613	\$43,508	\$44,421	\$45,354	\$46,307	\$47,279

# Salary Structure Development



Insurance | Risk Management | Consulting

## Proposed New Structure at Market – Public Safety:

Position	0	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9	10
Assistant Chief Of Police									\$95,525.90	\$97,914.05	\$100,361.90
Police Captain								\$84,723.64	\$86,841.73	\$89,012.77	\$91,238.09
Police Lieutenant							\$75,142.91	\$77,021.49	\$78,947.02	\$80,920.70	\$82,943.72
Police Sergeant						\$66,645.60	\$68,311.74	\$70,019.53	\$71,770.02	\$73,564.27	\$75,403.38
Police Corporal					\$59,109.18	\$60,586.91	\$62,101.58	\$63,654.12	\$65,245.48	\$66,876.61	\$68,548.53
Police Detective					\$57,983.29	\$59,432.87	\$60,918.70	\$62,441.66	\$64,002.70	\$65,602.77	\$67,242.84
Police Officer	\$51,000.00	\$52,275.00	\$53,581.88	\$54,921.42	\$56,294.46	\$57,701.82	\$59,144.36	\$60,622.97	\$62,138.55	\$63,692.01	\$65,284.31
Police Recruit	\$48,571.43										
Deputy Fire Chief											
Assistant Fire Marshal											\$86,713.89
Fire Battalion Chief/Emt										\$80,570.39	\$82,584.65
Fire Battalion Chief/Medic										\$76,733.71	\$78,652.05
Fire Captain/Medic							\$68,016.02	\$69,716.42	\$71,459.33	\$73,245.81	\$75,076.96
Fire Captain/EMT							\$64,777.16	\$66,396.59	\$68,056.50	\$69,757.92	\$71,501.87
Fire Fighter/Medic	\$51,000.00	\$52,275.00	\$53,581.88	\$54,921.42	\$56,294.46	\$57,701.82	\$59,144.36	\$60,622.97	\$62,138.55	\$63,692.01	\$65,284.31
Fire Fighter/EMT	\$48,571.43	\$49,785.71	\$51,030.36	\$52,306.12	\$53,613.77	\$54,954.11	\$56,327.97	\$57,736.17	\$59,179.57	\$60,659.06	\$62,175.54
Chief Deputy Sheriff											
Sr. Deputy Sheriff									\$65,001.79	\$66,626.84	\$68,292.51
Deputy Sheriff	\$48,500.00	\$49,712.50	\$50,955.31	\$52,229.20	\$53,534.93	\$54,873.30	\$56,245.13	\$57,651.26	\$59,092.54	\$60,569.85	\$62,084.10



# Salary Structure Development



Insurance | Risk Management | Consulting

## Proposed New Structure at Market – Public Safety:

<i>Position</i>	<i>11</i>	<i>12</i>	<i>13</i>	<i>14</i>	<i>15</i>	<i>16</i>	<i>17</i>	<i>18</i>	<i>19</i>
Assistant Chief Of Police	\$102,870.95	\$105,442.72	\$108,078.79	\$110,780.76	\$113,550.28	\$116,389.03	\$119,298.76	\$122,281.23	\$125,338.26
Police Captain	\$93,519.04	\$95,857.02	\$98,253.44	\$100,709.78	\$103,227.52	\$105,808.21	\$108,453.42	\$111,164.75	\$113,943.87
Police Lieutenant	\$85,017.31	\$87,142.74	\$89,321.31	\$91,554.35	\$93,843.20	\$96,189.28	\$98,594.02	\$101,058.87	\$103,585.34
Police Sergeant	\$77,288.46	\$79,220.68	\$81,201.19	\$83,231.22	\$85,312.00	\$87,444.80	\$89,630.92	\$91,871.70	\$94,168.49
Police Corporal	\$70,262.24	\$72,018.80	\$73,819.27	\$75,664.75	\$77,556.37	\$79,495.28	\$81,482.66	\$83,519.72	\$85,607.72
Police Detective	\$68,923.91	\$70,647.01	\$72,413.19	\$74,223.51	\$76,079.10	\$77,981.08	\$79,930.61	\$81,928.87	\$83,977.09
Police Officer	\$66,916.42	\$68,589.33	\$70,304.06	\$72,061.66	\$73,863.21	\$75,709.79	\$77,602.53	\$79,542.59	\$81,531.16
Police Recruit									
Deputy Fire Chief	\$97,769.91	\$100,214.16	\$102,719.51	\$105,287.50	\$107,919.68	\$110,617.68	\$113,383.12	\$116,217.70	\$119,123.14
Assistant Fire Marshal	\$88,881.73	\$91,103.78	\$93,381.37	\$95,715.91	\$98,108.80	\$100,561.52	\$103,075.56	\$105,652.45	\$108,293.76
Fire Battalion Chief/Emt	\$84,649.27	\$86,765.50	\$88,934.64	\$91,158.01	\$93,436.96	\$95,772.88	\$98,167.20	\$100,621.38	\$103,136.92
Fire Battalion Chief/Medic	\$80,618.35	\$82,633.81	\$84,699.66	\$86,817.15	\$88,987.58	\$91,212.27	\$93,492.57	\$95,829.89	\$98,225.63
Fire Captain/Medic	\$76,953.88	\$78,877.73	\$80,849.67	\$82,870.91	\$84,942.69	\$87,066.25	\$89,242.91	\$91,473.98	\$93,760.83
Fire Captain/EMT	\$73,289.41	\$75,121.65	\$76,999.69	\$78,924.68	\$80,897.80	\$82,920.24	\$84,993.25	\$87,118.08	\$89,296.03
Fire Fighter/Medic	\$66,916.42	\$68,589.33	\$70,304.06	\$72,061.66	\$73,863.21	\$75,709.79	\$77,602.53	\$79,542.59	\$81,531.16
Fire Fighter/EMT	\$63,729.92	\$65,323.17	\$66,956.25	\$68,630.16	\$70,345.91	\$72,104.56	\$73,907.17	\$75,754.85	\$77,648.72
Chief Deputy Sheriff	\$76,999.81	\$78,924.80	\$80,897.92	\$82,920.37	\$84,993.38	\$87,118.21	\$89,296.17	\$91,528.57	\$93,816.79
Sr. Deputy Sheriff	\$69,999.82	\$71,749.82	\$73,543.56	\$75,382.15	\$77,266.71	\$79,198.37	\$81,178.33	\$83,207.79	\$85,287.99
Deputy Sheriff	\$63,636.20	\$65,227.11	\$66,857.79	\$68,529.23	\$70,242.46	\$71,998.52	\$73,798.49	\$75,643.45	\$77,534.53

# Salary Structure Development



Insurance | Risk Management | Consulting

## Proposed New Structure at Market – Public Safety:

<i>Position</i>	<i>20</i>	<i>21</i>	<i>22</i>	<i>23</i>	<i>24</i>	<i>25</i>
Assistant Chief Of Police	\$128,471.72	\$131,683.51	\$134,975.60	\$138,349.99	\$141,808.74	\$145,353.95
Police Captain	\$116,792.47	\$119,712.28	\$122,705.09	\$125,772.71	\$128,917.03	\$132,139.96
Police Lieutenant	\$106,174.97	\$108,829.35	\$111,550.08	\$114,338.83	\$117,197.30	\$120,127.23
Police Sergeant	\$96,522.70	\$98,935.77	\$101,409.16	\$103,944.39	\$106,543.00	\$109,206.58
Police Corporal	\$87,747.91	\$89,941.61	\$92,190.15	\$94,494.90	\$96,857.27	\$99,278.71
Police Detective	\$86,076.52	\$88,228.43	\$90,434.15	\$92,695.00	\$95,012.37	\$97,387.68
Police Officer	\$83,569.44	\$85,658.67	\$87,800.14	\$89,995.14	\$92,245.02	\$94,551.15
Police Recruit						
Deputy Fire Chief	\$122,101.22	\$125,153.75	\$128,282.59	\$131,489.66	\$134,776.90	\$138,146.32
Assistant Fire Marshal	\$111,001.11	\$113,776.13	\$116,620.54	\$119,536.05	\$122,524.45	\$125,587.56
Fire Battalion Chief/Emt	\$105,715.34	\$108,358.22	\$111,067.18	\$113,843.86	\$116,689.95	\$119,607.20
Fire Battalion Chief/Medic	\$100,681.28	\$103,198.31	\$105,778.27	\$108,422.72	\$111,133.29	\$113,911.62
Fire Captain/Medic	\$96,104.85	\$98,507.48	\$100,970.16	\$103,494.42	\$106,081.78	\$108,733.82
Fire Captain/EMT	\$91,528.43	\$93,816.64	\$96,162.06	\$98,566.11	\$101,030.26	\$103,556.02
Fire Fighter/Medic	\$83,569.44	\$85,658.67	\$87,800.14	\$89,995.14	\$92,245.02	\$94,551.15
Fire Fighter/EMT	\$79,589.94	\$81,579.69	\$83,619.18	\$85,709.66	\$87,852.40	\$90,048.71
Chief Deputy Sheriff	\$96,162.21	\$98,566.26	\$101,030.42	\$103,556.18	\$106,145.08	\$108,798.71
Sr. Deputy Sheriff	\$87,420.19	\$89,605.69	\$91,845.83	\$94,141.98	\$96,495.53	\$98,907.92
Deputy Sheriff	\$79,472.90	\$81,459.72	\$83,496.21	\$85,583.62	\$87,723.21	\$89,916.29

## Implementation Method & Cost

- The proposed salary structure based on the 50<sup>th</sup> percentile of the market was run through two cost implementation options:
  - Bring to Minimum: Identifies any employees below the minimum and determines the cost to move all employees to the new minimum.
  - Bring to Midpoint: If an employee is at the midpoint of the current structure, the calculation maintains them at the midpoint of the new range.

All Groups	Count of Employees	Cost Projection	% of Salary Budget
To New Minimum	202	\$665,752	0.9%
To Range Midpoint	666	\$7,446,482	9.7%



# Implementation Cost

General Government	Count of Employees	Cost Projection	% of Salary Budget
To New Minimum	140	\$548,936	0.7%
To Range Midpoint	410	\$3,623,784	4.7%

Transit	Count of Employees	Cost Projection	% of Salary Budget
To New Minimum	0	\$0	0%
To Range Midpoint	73	\$560,841	0.7%

Public Safety	Count of Employees	Cost Projection	% of Salary Budget
To New Minimum	62	\$116,816	0.2%
To Range Midpoint	183	\$3,261,857	4.3%

# APPENDIX

Consulting and insurance brokerage services to be provided by Gallagher Benefit Services, Inc. and/or its affiliate Gallagher Benefit Services (Canada) Group Inc. Gallagher Benefit Services, Inc. is a licensed insurance agency that does business in California as "Gallagher Benefit Services of California Insurance Services" and in Massachusetts as "Gallagher Benefit Insurance Services." Neither Arthur J. Gallagher & Co., nor its affiliates provide accounting, legal or tax advice.



**Gallagher**

Insurance | Risk Management | Consulting



**Gallagher**

Insurance | Risk Management | Consulting

# Pay Practices & Benefits

## Summary of Comparable Organizations' Data



# Pay Practices & Benefits Summary

- The following pay practices and benefits summary are aggregated from custom survey results.

## Comparable Organization Data

	Median	City of Charlottesville
Net Operating Revenue	\$306 million	N/A
Annual Operating Expenses	\$277 million	\$212.9 million
FTEs Employed	600	1051



# Pay Practices & Benefits Summary

## Base Salary Increase

		Median	City of Charlottesville
Most Recent Base Salary Adjustment	COLA (Cost of Living Adjustment)	4.0%	3.0%
	Merit	5.0%	N/A
	Step Progression	N/A	N/A
	General Increase (not COLA)	5.0%	N/A
	Adjustment Date	07/01/2022	07/01/2022
Additional Base Salary Adjustment (next 6 to 12 months)	COLA (Cost of Living Adjustment)	4.0%	6.0%
	Adjustment Date	07/01/2023	TBD





# Pay Practices & Benefits Summary

## Established salary structure

	Number of Organizations	City of Charlottesville
Salary Structure Established	15	Yes
Open Range	11	Yes
Step Plan	4	No
Median		
Average No. of Pay Grades	25	N/A
Average No. of Steps within Each Grade	16	N/A
Average Range Spread	28%	89%
Average Midpoint Increase%	7.5%	N/A

# Pay Practices & Benefits Summary



Insurance | Risk Management | Consulting

## Established Salary Structure & Adjustments

		Median	City of Charlottesville
Most Recent Salary Structure Adjustment	Total Percentage	4.0%	N/A
	Adjustment Date	7/1/2022	7/1/2022
Additional Salary Structure Adjustment (next 6 months)	Total Percentage	N/A	TBD
	Adjustment Date	N/A	N/A



# Pay Practices & Benefits Summary

## Personal/Vacation Leave

	Number of Organizations	City of Charlottesville
Separate days for vacation, sick, and personal leave	13	Yes
Combined bank for all time off	2	No
Unlimited paid time off	1	No



# Pay Practices & Benefits Summary

## Personal/Vacation Leave

Years of Service	Hours/Year	Median	
		Maximum Carryover (Hours)	City of Charlottesville (Based on 40 Hours Per Week)
1 - 4 years	96	24	160
5 - 9 years	120	30	200
10 - 14 years	144	36	220
15 - 19 years	170	42	240
20 or more years	192	46	260-280
Maximum pay out for accrued vacations (Hours) upon retirement, resignation, termination, or death	288	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Carryover is 240 for &lt;20 years and 320 for 20+; payout is 100% up to maximum carryover</li> <li>• No Maximum</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Maximum payout varies from 120-240 hours based on years of service</li> </ul>

\* Reported data not including Sick Leave.



# Pay Practices & Benefits Summary

## Sick Leave

		Median	
Years of Service	Hours/Year	Maximum Carryover (Hours)	City of Charlottesville
1 - 4 years	96	104	120 Hours
5 - 9 years	96		
10 - 14 years	96		
15 - 19 years	96		
20 or more years	96		
Maximum pay out for accrued vacations (Hours) upon retirement, resignation, termination, or death	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Unlimited maximum. None paid outside of retirement. At retirement 50% of 1400 hours of sick leave is paid. Or a maximum of 720 hours.</li> <li>• Sick leave is not paid out, unless employee retires.</li> <li>• 25% sick leave up to \$4,000 max.</li> <li>• Unlimited accrual for those hired before 2014; An employee with at least 5 yos, 25% of accumulated SL to a max of \$5k; An employee with at least 12 yos, 25% of accumulated SL to a max of \$7500; An employee with at least 20 yos, 25% of accumulated SL to a max of \$10k; Retiring employee may use the cash payment to purchase VRS service credit; A retiring employee may use the cash payment from either vacation or sick leave to contribute to their tax-deferred compensation plan.</li> <li>• All unused credited sick leave.</li> <li>• 25% of balance up to \$20,000 but payment limit is based on years of tenure.</li> </ul>		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• No Payout</li> </ul>



# Pay Practices & Benefits Summary

## Combined Bank of Days (Personal/Vacation and Sick Leave)

Years of Service	Median		City of Charlottesville
	Hours/Year	Maximum Carryover (Hours)	
1 - 4 years	120	27	N/A
5 - 9 years	144	31	N/A
10 - 14 years	168	36	N/A
15 - 19 years	192	40	N/A
20 or more years	198	45	N/A
Number of Organizations			
Employees can carry-over or "bank" unused leave	8		N/A



# Pay Practices & Benefits Summary

## Additional Days Off

	Number of Organizations	City of Charlottesville
Additional days given to employees on top of accrued time	3	No
Number of additional days and purpose	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• 16 hours - 2 floating holidays</li> <li>• 3 personal holidays</li> <li>• Floater Holidays</li> </ul>	N/A
Maximum pay out for accrued PTO (Hours) upon retirement, resignation, termination, or death	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• &lt;1 yr 0%; 1-9 yrs - 25%; 10-19 yrs - 37.5%; 20+ yrs - 66.6%.</li> <li>• Yes, max payout for accumulated PTO hours; PTO payout for emergency withdraw under certain circumstances.</li> <li>• 400 hours</li> </ul>	N/A



# Pay Practices & Benefits Summary

## Bereavement Leave & Holiday

	Days (Median)	City of Charlottesville
Bereavement Leave	3	3
Holidays	13	14





# Pay Practices & Benefits Summary

## Retirement Plan

	Summary	City of Charlottesville
Virginia Retirement System (VRS) entity	14 Organizations	No
Independent Defined Benefit Pension Plan	2	Yes
Employees contribute to Independent Defined Benefit Pension Plan	1	Yes
Deferred Contribution Plan Types	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• City Plan (401a)</li> <li>• 457 Plan</li> <li>• VRS Hybrid Retirement Plan</li> <li>• Virginia Retirement System (VRS Plan 1, Plan 2 and Hybrid)</li> <li>• Part of VRS Hybrid Plan</li> <li>• Virginia Retirement System (State Defined Benefit Pension Plan)</li> <li>• Employee contribution 5%</li> <li>• Employee contribution 7%</li> </ul>	•57
Number of years before an employee is considered vested	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Hybrid - 4 years (although employees are eligible for percentages past two years); Voluntary - none.</li> <li>• 5 years</li> </ul>	5 Years
Employer Contributions (% of pay, formula for calculation, description)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• 2 organizations</li> <li>• \$15.00 per pay period</li> <li>• \$20.00 per pay period</li> <li>• match is dollar for dollar match up to \$20 per pay</li> </ul>	.016 x AFC x years of service

# Pay Practices & Benefits Summary



**Gallagher**

Insurance | Risk Management | Consulting

## Health Insurance

Summary		City of Charlottesville
Most Popular Medical Plan	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• PPO 300</li> <li>• Healthkeepers</li> <li>• KeyCare 25 PPO</li> <li>• Anthem - PPO</li> <li>• Plan A - Premier Plan - Open Access Plus 20/40</li> <li>• KeyCare 1000</li> <li>• Cigna</li> <li>• PPO</li> <li>• Cigna OAP PPO - Med Standard</li> <li>• Premier POS</li> <li>• Cigna POS</li> </ul>	POS 1
Self-Insured Plan	4	Yes

# Pay Practices & Benefits Summary

## Health Insurance



**Gallagher**

Insurance | Risk Management | Consulting

Comparator Organizations				
	Monthly Employer Cost (\$)	Monthly Employee Cost (\$)	Total	ANNUAL Employee Out-of-pocket maximum (\$)
EE	\$663	\$113	\$774	\$4,000
EE + Spouse	\$1,055	\$441	\$1,484	\$8,000
EE + Child	\$924	\$351	\$1,143	\$8,000
EE + 1	\$1,198	\$359	\$0	\$10,000
EE + Children	\$968	\$297	\$1,114	\$9,000
EE + Family (or EE + 2 or More)	\$1,525	\$705	\$2,114	\$8,000

City of Charlottesville				
	Monthly Employer Cost (\$)	Monthly Employee Cost (\$)	Total	ANNUAL Employee Out-of-pocket maximum (\$)
EE	\$772.61	\$78.60	\$851.21	\$2,000
EE + Spouse	\$1,273.27	\$514.28	\$1,787.55	\$4,000
EE + Child	\$857.89	\$333.81	\$1,191.70	\$4,000
EE + 1			\$0.00	\$4,000
EE + Children	\$1,085.83	\$446.35	\$1,532.18	\$4,000
EE + Family (or EE + 2 or More)	\$1,813.87	\$654.65	\$2,468.52	\$4,000



# Pay Practices & Benefits Summary

## Health Insurance

<u>Employer HSA Contributions</u>	Monthly Employer Cost (\$)	City of Charlottesville
EE	\$629	N/A
EE + Spouse	\$1,021	N/A
EE + Child	\$970	N/A
EE + 1	\$4,625	N/A
EE + Children	\$956	N/A
EE + Family (or EE + 2 or More)	\$1,277	N/A

<u>Employer HRA Contributions</u>	Monthly Employer Cost (\$)	City of Charlottesville
EE	N/A	\$500
EE + Spouse	N/A	\$900
EE + Child	N/A	\$900
EE + 1	N/A	N/A
EE + Children	N/A	\$1,000
EE + Family (or EE + 2 or More)	N/A	\$1,400



# Pay Practices & Benefits Summary

## Dental Insurance

Summary		City of Charlottesville
Dental Plan	12	Yes
Most Popular Medical Plan	<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• Ameritas Dental</li><li>• Delta Dental - Included in Health Plan Cost</li><li>• DHMO</li><li>• Cigna</li><li>• Anthem Complete High</li><li>• Delta Dental PPO</li></ul>	PPO
Self-Insured Plan	1	Yes

# Pay Practices & Benefits Summary



Insurance | Risk Management | Consulting

## Dental Insurance

Comparator Organizations				
	Monthly Employer Cost (\$)	Monthly Employee Cost (\$)	Total	ANNUAL Employee Out-of-pocket maximum (\$)
EE	\$21	\$17	\$35	\$2,000
EE + Spouse	\$20	\$47	\$63	N/A
EE + Child	\$21	\$34	\$60	N/A
EE + 1	\$55	\$21	\$0	N/A
EE + Children	\$0	\$79	\$32	N/A
EE + Family (or EE + 2 or More)	\$26	\$64	\$106	N/A

City of Charlottesville				
	Monthly Employer Cost (\$)	Monthly Employee Cost (\$)	Total	ANNUAL Employee Out-of-pocket maximum (\$)
EE	\$33.80	\$0.00	\$33.80	N/A
EE + Spouse	\$33.80	\$23.18	\$56.98	N/A
EE + Child	\$33.80	\$18.24	\$52.04	N/A
EE + 1	\$33.80		\$33.80	N/A
EE + Children	\$33.80	\$23.18	\$56.98	N/A
EE + Family (or EE + 2 or More)	\$33.80	\$46.02	\$79.82	N/A



# Pay Practices & Benefits Summary

## Vision Insurance

	Summary	City of Charlottesville
Vision Plan	9	Yes
Most Popular Medical Plan	EyeMed	N/A
Self-Insured Plan	1	Fully Insured

# Pay Practices & Benefits Summary



**Gallagher**

Insurance | Risk Management | Consulting

## Vision Insurance

### Comparator Organizations

	Monthly Employer Cost (\$)	Monthly Employee Cost (\$)	Total	ANNUAL Employee Out-of-pocket maximum (\$)
EE	N/A	\$6	\$6	N/A
EE + Spouse	N/A	\$11	\$11	N/A
EE + Child	N/A	\$11	\$11	N/A
EE + 1	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A
EE + Children	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A
EE + Family (or EE + 2 or More)	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A

### City of Charlottesville

	Monthly Employer Cost (\$)	Monthly Employee Cost (\$)	Total	ANNUAL Employee Out-of-pocket maximum (\$)
EE	N/A	\$5.41	\$5.41	N/A
EE + Spouse	N/A	\$10.82	\$10.82	N/A
EE + Child	N/A	\$9.15	\$9.15	N/A
EE + 1	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A
EE + Children	N/A	\$15.11	\$15.11	N/A
EE + Family (or EE + 2 or More)	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A





# Pay Practices & Benefits Summary

## Employee Discounts

	Number of Organizations	City of Charlottesville
Discounts offered for employees and spouse who both work at the organization	4	Yes



# Pay Practices & Benefits Summary

## Health Insurance for Retirees

	Number of Organizations	Policy Descriptions	City of Charlottesville
Health insurance supplement provided for retirees	8	<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• Prior to 65 they are eligible for our employee coverage but at a higher retiree rate. After 65 we offer them a Humana plan.</li><li>• Medicare eligible retirees can continue health coverage through the County sponsored enrollment service. If enrolled in a medical supplemental plan through this service, eligible retirees receive a monthly supplement, available through HRA.</li></ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• Eligibility for retiree health insurance is dependent on 1) retirement plan (DB 1, DB2, DB3 or DC) 2) date of hire and 3) years of service</li></ul>
Health insurance supplement provided for retirees after Medicare eligibility	3		



**Gallagher**

Insurance | Risk Management | Consulting

# Recommendations

# Recommendations



Insurance | Risk Management | Consulting

- Implement the proposed salary structure.
- Select an implementation option for updating employee salaries.
- The salary structure should be adjusted by a structure movement trend factor every year to remain competitive with the market.
- In addition to adjusting the salary structure each year to keep pace with the market, the City should continue to conduct a comprehensive compensation study at least every three years.
- Revise and modernize the City's Pay Policies and Practices to promote compensation best practices, support employee retention and recruitment objectives.



# On-Going System Management

## Pay Administration Guidelines

- Pay administration guidelines should be implemented for placing and moving employees through the structure, Gallagher recommends the following:
  - The hiring range should be from the range minimum for minimally acceptable qualified individuals to the first quartile (25th percentile) for well qualified individuals.
  - Appointment above the first quartile should require the approval of Human Resources; Appointment above the midpoint should require the approval of the City Manager/Designee.
- The City should annually review its internal alignment and classification of jobs to ensure proper leveling between jobs.
- Individual salary advancement (base pay increase) through the ranges should be based on competent performance in the job class.
- Individual salary should increase at a higher rate than the salary range adjustment.
  - If the City increases the salary ranges for 2% for 2022, employees' base salary increase should be higher than 2%. E.g., 2.5% or 3%.

# Thank you!

Consulting and insurance brokerage services to be provided by Gallagher Benefit Services, Inc. and/or its affiliate Gallagher Benefit Services (Canada) Group Inc. Gallagher Benefit Services, Inc. is a licensed insurance agency that does business in California as "Gallagher Benefit Services of California Insurance Services" and in Massachusetts as "Gallagher Benefit Insurance Services." Neither Arthur J. Gallagher & Co., nor its affiliates provide accounting, legal or tax advice.



**Gallagher**

Insurance | Risk Management | Consulting